

LEARNING OUTCOMES: HOW DOES THE EXPERIMENTATION OF THE CIRC MODELS?

Nabilla Marsya Nada¹, Nurul Azizah², Siti Zulaikhah³ Baharudin⁴, Waluyo Erry Wahyudi⁵

*Correspondence email: nabillamarsyanada21@gmail.com

¹ UIN Raden Intan Lampung, Indonesia

(Submitted: 30-11-2024, Revised: 31-12-2024, Accepted: 31-12-2024)

ABSTRAK: Penelitian membahas tentang bagaimana percobaan atau penerapan model pembelajaran CIRC dapat mempengaruhi hasil belajar peserta didik. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menganalisis apakah penerapan model pembelajaran CIRC (Cooperative, Integrated, Reading and Composition) dapat memengaruhi hasil belajar peserta didik dalam mata pelajaran Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam (SKI) di MAN 1 Pringsewu. Penelitian ini dilakukan dengan metode eksperimen menggunakan desain kelompok kontrol dengan post-test only control-group. Sampel dalam penelitian ini terdiri dari dua kelas, yaitu kelas eksperimen yang menerapkan model pembelajaran CIRC dan kelas kontrol yang menggunakan metode pembelajaran konvensional. Pengumpulan data dilakukan melalui tes hasil belajar SKI yang diberikan setelah pelaksanaan perlakuan. Data dianalisis menggunakan uji T untuk melihat apakah terdapat perbedaan signifikan pada hasil belajar siswa antara yang menggunakan model CIRC dan yang tidak. Implikasi dari penelitian ini mencakup perlunya menggunakan model pembelajaran yang interaktif dalam pembelajaran SKI dan perlunya pendidik mengambil keputusan untuk menciptakan metode pengajaran yang fleksibel dan dapat disesuaikan. Hasil penelitian mengungkapkan bahwa penggunaan model pembelajaran CIRC secara signifikan meningkatkan hasil belajar siswa, khususnya dalam pemahaman materi dan kemampuan bekerja sama. Berdasarkan hasil uji T, nilai Sig. (2-tailed) sebesar 0,001 yang lebih kecil dari 0,05. Dengan demikian, sesuai keputusan uji independent sample t-test, dapat disimpulkan bahwa H_0 ditolak dan H_a diterima. Hasil penelitian ini menunjukkan bahwa model pembelajaran CIRC terbukti efektif dalam meningkatkan hasil belajar, khususnya pada mata pelajaran SKI di MAN 1 Pringsewu.

Kata Kunci: Model Pembelajaran, CIRC, Hasil Belajar

ABSTRACT: The study explores how implementing the CIRC learning model impacts students' learning outcomes. This study aims to evaluate the effectiveness of the CIRC (Cooperative, Integrated, Reading, and Composition) learning model on students' learning outcomes in Islamic Cultural History (SKI) at MAN 1 Pringsewu. This research employs an experimental method using a post-test-only control group design. The participants are divided into two groups: the experimental group, which applies the CIRC learning model, and the control group, which follows the traditional teaching method. Data was collected through a post-treatment SKI test. A T-test was performed to analyze the data and determine if

there were significant differences in the learning outcomes between students taught using the CIRC model and those taught with the traditional method. The implications of this study suggest the need to use an interactive learning model in SKI lessons and that educators should make decisions to create flexible and adaptable teaching methods. The study's findings indicate a notable improvement in students' learning outcomes when using the CIRC model, especially in understanding the material and developing collaborative skills. The results of the T-test show a Sig. (2-tailed) value of 0.001, which is below 0.05. Therefore, according to the independent sample t-test decision criteria, H_0 is rejected and H_a is accepted. These findings indicate that the CIRC learning model is effective in improving learning outcomes, especially in SKI at MAN 1 Pringsewu.

Keywords: *Learning Model, CIRC, Learning Outcomes*

I. INTRODUCTION

Education should be structured in a holistic manner and connected with other systems to achieve its goals and improve the quality of human life in all aspects. The educational process, which encompasses individuals, communities, and the material-spiritual reality, influences the character and fate of humans. In other words, education serves as a solid foundation for the implementation of sustainable education based on strong knowledge and methods, while in Islamic teachings, the foundation of education functions as the cornerstone of everything that is built. (Ariyana & Suastika, 2022; Khaidir et al., 2020; Rahman et al., 2022; Saputra, 2022; Setiawan et al., 2022). Each student has unique characteristics and learning needs, where these characteristics can influence their perspectives, thinking, and actions. To address individual differences among students, attention can be focused on these differences by applying teaching strategies that consider each student's unique characteristics to ensure effective learning outcomes. (Marhamah & Zikriati, 2024; Maulidia & Prafitasari, 2023; Nuril Lubaba & Alfiansyah, 2022; Rachmadhani & Kamalia, 2023).

Learning outcomes refer to the abilities acquired by students after experiencing the learning process, encompassing the affective, cognitive, and psychomotor domains. These outcomes serve as indicators of the success of learning and provide a basis for educators to evaluate competencies and create appropriate learning models. In this context, behavioral changes and the achievement of competencies become evidence that an individual has learned. (Agusti & Aslam, 2022; Maulidia & Prafitasari, 2023; Purwaningsih, 2023; Setiawan et al., 2022; Sewang1 & Aswad2, 2023).

Law Number 20 of 2003 regarding the National Education System (UU Sisdiknas) defines learning as an interactive process involving students, educators, and learning resources within a particular environment. Additionally, the Minister of Education and Culture Regulation Number 103 of 2014 also addresses the concept of learning.

Indonesia has taken steps to enhance the quality of life across different sectors, including social and education, by implementing the "Merdeka Belajar" (Independent

Learning) curriculum, which emphasizes freedom of thought and student-centered learning. This initiative, introduced by the Minister of Education, Nadiem Makarim, addresses the needs of students and the competitive challenges they encounter. The Merdeka curriculum prioritizes character development and student skills, with a stronger focus on core knowledge (Efendi et al., 2023; Indarta et al., 2022; Nurohmah et al., 2023; Rahmi Yulia, 2023; Suryaman, 2020).



Figure 1

Bar Diagram of Student Learning Outcome Tests

The data indicates that the cognitive levels C3-C6 are still low, with more than 50% of students providing incorrect answers. The focus of this study is on levels C3, C4, C5, and C6, while the researcher does not focus on cognitive levels C1 and C2, as the data for C1 and C2 is considered to already meet the students' needs at the school. The pre-research, which included observations and interviews with SKI teachers at MAN 1 Pringsewu, revealed several issues in SKI learning. These included differences in students' understanding of the material, limited interaction with the lesson due to ineffective teaching methods, and poor utilization of resources. At the same time, students encounter challenges like poor learning outcomes and a lack of interest in the learning process. The observations and interviews showed that many students have not yet met the Minimum Completion Criteria (KKM) for the SKI subject, indicating the need for the adoption of a more effective teaching model to improve learning outcomes, especially due to the potential ineffectiveness of the conventional teaching model currently in use.

A cooperative learning model, such as CIRC, is needed to enhance student's learning outcomes, especially in reading and writing. This model integrates an integrated and collaborative approach to learning, allowing students to better understand the material, collaborate with one another, and shift away from conventional learning patterns. Cooperative learning is an approach where students work together in small, either homogeneous or heterogeneous, groups to study the material, help each other, and are evaluated individually or as a group. (Bjørke & Mordal Moen, 2020; Erbil, 2020;

Hasanah & Himami, 2021; Silva et al., 2022; Wongsuwan & Regiana, 2023). CIRC (Cooperative, Integrated, Reading, and Composition) is a form of cooperative learning approach. CIRC itself is an integrated learning model that promotes collaboration and interaction among students through group assignments. This model can enhance reading comprehension, long-term knowledge retention, and social skills such as cooperation, tolerance, and communication, thereby creating an active and meaningful learning experience. (Maruf & Anjely², 2020; Mauizatul Hayati, 2024; Nani et al., 2022; Rahmi & Marnola, 2020; Tarigan, 2022).

The results of research conducted by several expert researchers, including Susiana, Aisyiah Al Adawiyah, and M. Melati Putri, Demonstrate the potential of the CIRC learning model in improving student engagement and learning results, especially in reading and writing comprehension (Al Adawiyah, 2023; Melati Putri & Astuti, 2023; Susiani, 2022), The benefits of the CIRC learning model include supporting the alignment of learning with student development, improving thinking skills, and promoting social interaction (Awaliyah, 2023; Nofrianni, 2023; Sari, 2023; Syafitri & Mansurdin, 2020).

The uniqueness of this study is found in the fact that, through this learning model, students can interact with each other in terms of collaboration. Additionally, students can develop a better understanding of Islamic Culture History (SKI) in an active manner, which has the potential to impact their academic achievement. This experimental study examines the CIRC (Cooperative, Integrated, Reading and Composition) learning model and its effect on student learning outcomes, focusing on a rarely explored area and offering the potential to make a valuable contribution to the field of education.

This study is important for exploring the impact of the CIRC learning model on student outcomes in the SKI subject, demonstrating that the model can enhance knowledge, social skills, and encourage teachers to create more flexible and interactive teaching approaches. It also serves as a foundation for future research on creative and relevant learning models. The results of this study provide a fresh perspective on how an interactive learning model can impact and enhance student knowledge and learning outcomes.

The implications of this study include the need to use interactive learning models in SKI lessons and the necessity for educators to make decisions to create flexible and adaptable teaching methods. As a result, this study not only enhances our understanding of how the CIRC learning model affects student learning outcomes in SKI, but also serves as a foundation for future researchers on more creative and relevant learning models.

II. RESEARCH METHOD

This research is an experimental study with a quantitative approach, utilizing a quasi-experimental design, specifically a post-test-only control group design. In this design, participants are not randomly assigned but are divided into an experimental group, which receives the treatment, and a control group, which does not. The study aims to

compare the outcomes after the treatment and analyze the impact of the CIRC learning model on student learning results.

The population of this study includes all eleventh-grade students at MAN 1 Pringsewu for the 2024/2025 academic year, consisting of 8 classes with a total of 262 students. The sample for this study consists of class XI C1, which will act as the control group using the traditional learning model, and class XI B2, which will act as the experimental group using the CIRC learning model. The researcher selected the sample using a probability sampling technique, specifically simple random sampling, where participants are chosen randomly without considering the groups within the population. Data was collected using a multiple-choice test instrument. Before administering the test items, the researcher had the questions validated by an expert. Next, the test items were given to a trial group that was separate from the experimental and control classes. The researcher then performed validity and reliability tests. From the 15 questions covering C3-C6, 9 valid questions were selected. These 9 questions were then distributed to both the experimental and control classes. Data analysis in this study was performed using the IBM SPSS Statistics 27 application. This application was selected because it aligns well with the study's requirements and is easy to use. The study began with a normality test, but since the results indicated a non-normal distribution, the Mann-Whitney U test was used. After that, a homogeneity test was conducted, followed by a hypothesis test using the T-test.

III. THEORITICAL REVIEW

A. Learning Outcomes

Adam defines learning outcomes as the results of teaching that students are expected to reach following the learning process (Wahono et al., 2020). Adam further explained that learning outcomes are typically articulated in terms of knowledge, skills, and/or attitudes. Briggs explains that learning outcomes are the effectiveness and results students achieve during the learning process, as shown by the scores they obtain from assessments. According to Alexandron, Wiltrout Berg, and Ruiperez-Valiente, learning outcomes are a key indicator for assessing students' actual academic success and the effectiveness of teaching methods, as well as student learning (Wei et al., 2021).

Based on the definitions of learning outcomes provided by Adam, Briggs, Alexandron, Wiltrout, Berg, and Ruiperez-Valiente, the author concludes that learning outcomes represent the final achievements of the learning process, reflecting students' success in terms of cognitive, affective, and psychomotor aspects.

B. CIRC Learning Model

According to Slavin, CIRC is a comprehensive program that teaches children how to read and write (Sakkir & Haturrahma, 2023). The Integrated Cooperative Reading and

Composition (CIRC) model was one of the first cooperative learning approaches that integrated reading and writing into a unified instructional program for elementary and middle school students. Its activities primarily aim to optimize time usage. According to Septian, the CIRC model is designed to effectively enhance students' reading and writing abilities. According to Latifa & Haryadi, CIRC is a teaching approach in which students are paired and assigned tasks to read and summarize using a particular method or text (Mailani et al., 2024). According to Arend, CIRC is a comprehensive model used in elementary and secondary schools to teach reading and writing skills (Jannah et al., 2024).

Based on the definitions of the CIRC learning model provided by Slavin, Latifa & Haryadi, and Arend, the author concludes that the CIRC learning model is an instructional approach designed to develop reading and writing skills, helping students comprehend lesson material either individually or in groups.

IV. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

A. RESULT

Based on the data analysis of eleventh-grade students at MAN 1 Pringsewu, focusing on learning outcomes, the post-test results were assessed. These results, which include scores from the experimental group using the Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) learning model and the control group using the traditional teaching method, reflect the students' learning outcomes. The students' performance is evaluated based on the average scores they achieved. The post-test given to the students included multiple-choice questions that covered four indicators: C3 (Applying), C4 (Analyzing), C5 (Evaluating), and C6 (Creating).

A two-sample t-test was used to assess the difference between the experimental and control groups. However, normality and homogeneity tests were performed prior to conducting the t-test. The results of these tests are as follows.

Prerequisite Test

1) Normality Test

The normality test in this study is used to determine whether the post-test data follow a normal distribution. The data is regarded as normally distributed if the Sig. value is greater than 0.05. A summary of the learning outcomes of the eleventh-grade students at MAN 1 Pringsewu is shown in Table 1.

Table 1. Overview of the normality test results for the learning outcomes of eleventh-grade students at MAN 1 Pringsewu.

hasil	kelompok	Kolmogorov-Smirnov ^a			Shapiro-Wilk		
		Statistic	df	Sig.	Statistic	df	Sig.
	1.00	.159	30	.052	.912	30	.016
	2.00	.183	33	.007	.846	33	<.001

a. Lilliefors Significance Correction

Based on the SPSS output table, the Sig. value, which shows statistical significance, can be seen. The results of the Shapiro-Wilk normality test show significance values of 0.016 for the experimental group (1.00) and 0.001 for the control group (2.00). Since the Sig. value for both groups is less than 0.05 ($0.016 < 0.05$ for the experimental group and $0.001 < 0.05$ for the control group), it can be concluded that the data for both groups are not normally distributed. Given that both groups exhibit a non-normal distribution, the Mann-Whitney U test should be used to analyze the data, as outlined below.

Test Statistics^a

	hasil
Mann-Whitney U	101.000
Wilcoxon W	566.000
Z	-5.475
Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed)	<.001

a. Grouping Variable:
kelompok

The table shows a U value of 101 and a W value of 566. When converted to a Z value, it is -5.475. The Sig. value is $0.001 < 0.05$, suggesting a significant difference between the two groups, which means H1 is accepted.

1. Homogeneity Test

The homogeneity test is performed to determine whether the variances of the data distributions are equal (homogeneous) or different (heterogeneous). The data is considered homogeneous if the Sig. value is greater than 0.05.

Table 2. Summary of the homogeneity test results for the learning outcomes of the eleventh-grade students at MAN 1 Pringsewu.

Tests of Homogeneity of Variances

		Levene Statistic	df1	df2	Sig.
hasil	Based on Mean	.491	1	61	.486
	Based on Median	.341	1	61	.561
	Based on Median and with adjusted df	.341	1	50.215	.562
	Based on trimmed mean	.487	1	61	.488

According to the "Test of Homogeneity of Variances" output table, the significance (Sig.) value for the SKI learning outcomes in the XI B2 and XI C1 classes is 0.486. Since this value is greater than 0.05, it can be concluded, based on the decision rule for the homogeneity test, that the variance of the SKI learning outcomes data for both classes is equal or homogeneous.

2. Hypothesis Test

In this hypothesis test, a T-test was performed to assess whether the independent variable affects the dependent variable. A summary of the T-test results for the students' learning outcomes at MAN is presented in Table 3.

Table 3. Results of the T-test for the learning outcomes of eleventh-grade students at MAN 1 Pringsewu.

		Independent Samples Test								
		Levene's Test for Equality of Variances			t-test for Equality of Means				95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
		F	Sig.	t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)	Mean Difference	Std. Error Difference	Lower	Upper
hasil	Equal variances assumed	.491	.486	-7.233	61	<.001	-3.28485	.45415	-4.19298	-2.37672
	Equal variances not assumed			-7.300	60.463	<.001	-3.28485	.45000	-4.18485	-2.38485

According to the output table from the "Independent Samples Test" in the "Equal variances assumed" section, the Sig. (2-tailed) value is 0.001, which is less than 0.05. Therefore, based on the decision rule for the independent sample t-test, it can be concluded that H₀ is rejected and H_a is accepted. This indicates that the CIRC learning model is effective in improving learning outcomes.

B. DISCUSSION

The purpose of this study is to examine the impact of the CIRC learning model on enhancing student learning outcomes in the Islamic Cultural History (SKI) subject. The data analysis shows that the application of the CIRC model significantly boosted students' performance in answering SKI questions. The findings also reveal that the class taught with the CIRC model achieved higher average scores compared to the class taught with the traditional learning method.

In the CIRC learning model, students engage in collaborative interactions, allowing them to actively deepen their understanding of the SKI subject, which can enhance their academic performance (Jannah et al., 2024; Khairunisa & Basuki, 2021; Rahmi & Marnola, 2020; Sakkir & Haturrahma, 2023). This approach allows students to learn in groups, creating a stimulating and supportive learning environment that fosters their overall development.

		Independent Samples Test								
		Levene's Test for Equality of Variances			t-test for Equality of Means				95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
		F	Sig.	t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)	Mean Difference	Std. Error Difference	Lower	Upper
hasil	Equal variances assumed	.491	.486	-7.233	61	<.001	-3.28485	.45415	-4.19298	-2.37672
	Equal variances not assumed			-7.300	60.463	<.001	-3.28485	.45000	-4.18485	-2.38485

model and student learning outcomes in the SKI subject at the senior high school level. Data analysis indicates a significant difference in learning outcomes between students taught using the CIRC model and those taught with the traditional model. This is

supported by the average learning outcomes of both groups, with a significance value of 0.001 (which is lower than $\alpha = 0.05$).

In addition, observations during the study showed that students played an active role in the group discussions, which were central to this learning process. These results suggest that the CIRC learning method can enhance student involvement in the learning process. Its effectiveness on learning outcomes provides support in terms of reading comprehension and adequate time allocation.

Based on the research conducted by... Syamsia (2023), The research presented a distinction from previous studies, which found that the CIRC learning model was effective in enhancing students' reading skills. However, this study demonstrates that the CIRC learning model significantly improved students' learning outcomes. This is evident from the students' preference for using the CIRC model in their daily reading, with most of them providing positive feedback about the model. Additionally, the previous research differed from this study in terms of the dependent variable. The previous study focused on reading comprehension, while this study used learning outcomes as the object being measured.

The implementation of the CIRC learning model faced some challenges. The classroom conditions were not ideal, which required the teacher to take a more active role in overseeing the learning process. Additionally, the teacher struggled with managing time efficiently to ensure that each stage of the CIRC learning process was followed systematically. Therefore, it is crucial for the teacher to monitor student interactions and provide clear guidance during the learning process (Darmawan Harefa, 2023; Mangundap et al., 2023; Riana, 2022; Wahyuni, 2022).

In conclusion, the CIRC learning model has been shown to effectively enhance students' learning outcomes (Saragih et al., 2024). The use of the CIRC learning model can be an alternative and more effective teaching method than traditional approaches, particularly in increasing students' active participation in the learning process (Kondoalumang et al., 2022).

V. CONCLUSION

Based on the research findings and discussion, it can be concluded that the CIRC learning model has the potential to improve the learning outcomes of eleventh-grade students at MAN 1 Pringsewu, especially in the SKI subject. This conclusion is supported by the results of the T-test, which led to the rejection of H_0 and the acceptance of H_a . Therefore, it can be concluded that there is a significant difference in the average learning outcomes of students in the SKI subject. Consequently, the CIRC learning model is recommended as an effective approach to improve students' learning outcomes, particularly in SKI.

VI. REFERENCES

- Agusti, N. M., & Aslam, A. (2022). Efektivitas Media Pembelajaran Aplikasi Wordwall Terhadap Hasil Belajar IPA Siswa Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Basicedu*, 6(4), 5794–5800.
- Al Adawiyah, A. (2023). CIRC Learning Model For Reading Comprehension Of French Language. *JOLLT Journal of Languages and Language Teaching*, 11(1), 104.
- Ariyana, I. K. S., & Suastika, I. N. (2022). Model Pembelajaran CIRC (Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition) sebagai Salah Satu Strategi Pembelajaran Matematika di Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Ilmiah Universitas Batanghari Jambi*, 22(1), 203.
- Awaliyah, P. M. (2023). *Model Pembelajaran CIRC Dalam Meningkatkan Kemampuan Membaca Siswa*. 1–7.
- Bjørke, L., & Mordal Moen, K. (2020). Cooperative learning in physical education: a study of students' learning journey over 24 lessons. *Physical Education and Sport Pedagogy*, 25(6), 600–612.
- Darmawan Harefa. (2023). Efektivitas Model Pembelajaran Talking Chips Untuk Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Siswa. *TUNAS : Jurnal Pendidikan Biologi*, 4(1), 83–99.
- Efendi, P. M., Tatang Muhtar, & Yusuf Tri Herlambang. (2023). Relevansi Kurikulum Merdeka Dengan Konsepsi Ki Hadjar Dewantara: Studi Kritis Dalam Perspektif Filosofis-Pedagogis. *Jurnal Elementaria Edukasia*, 6(2), 548–561.
- Erbil, D. G. (2020). A Review of Flipped Classroom and Cooperative Learning Method Within the Context of Vygotsky Theory. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 11(June), 1–9.
- Hasanah, Z., & Himami, A. S. (2021). Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif Dalam Menumbuhkan Keaktifan Belajar Siswa. *Irsyaduna: Jurnal Studi Kemahasiswaan*, 1(1), 1–13.
- Indarta, Y., Jalinus, N., Waskito, W., Samala, A. D., Riyanda, A. R., & Adi, N. H. (2022). Relevansi Kurikulum Merdeka Belajar dengan Model Pembelajaran Abad 21 dalam Perkembangan Era Society 5.0. *EDUKATIF : JURNAL ILMU PENDIDIKAN*, 4(2), 3011–3024.
- Jannah, R., Aziiz Hari Mukti, W., Islam Negeri Fatmawati Sukarno Bengkulu, U., Fatmawati Sukarno Bengkulu, U., & Raden Patah Pagar Dewa, J. (2024). The Influence of the Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) Learning Model Assisted by Audio-Visual Media on Science Learning Outcomes of Class VII Solar System Material SMPN 8 South Bengkulu. *Indonesian Journal of Education & Mathematical Science*, 5(1), 19–26.
- Khaidir, E., Suud, F. M., Sultan, N., Riau, S. K., Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, U., & Com, E. (2020). Islamic Education In Developing Students' Characters At As-Shofa Islamic High School, Pekanbaru Riau. *IJIEP: International Journal of Islamic Educational Psychology*, 1(1).
- Khairunisa, R. W., & Basuki. (2021). Perbandingan Kemampuan Komunikasi Matematis Siswa antara Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif Tipe TPS dan CIRC. *Plusminus: Jurnal Pendidikan Matematika*, 1(1), 113–124.
- Kondoalumang, S. O., Rindengan, M. E., & Sumilat, J. M. (2022). Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) untuk Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Pembelajaran Tematik Siswa Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Basicedu*, 6(2), 2710–2716.

- Mailani, E., Tarigan, D., & Sitanggang, A. K. (2024). Development of a Learning Tool using the Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) Model Based on Thinkable. *QALAMUNA: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosial, Dan Agama*, 16(1), 31–48.
- Mangundap, E. G. M., Katuuk, D. A., Monigir, N. N., & Kumolontang, D. (2023). Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) untuk Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Bahasa Indonesia Siswa Kelas IV SD Negeri 2 Tomohon. *Epistema*, 4(1), 22–30.
- Marhamah, & Zikriati. (2024). Mengenal Kebutuhan Peserta Didik Diera Kurikulum Merdeka. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Humaniora*, 1(1), 89–106.
- Maruf, N., & Anjely², M. R. (2020). British, Jurnal Bahasa dan Sastra Inggris Utilizing Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition (CIRC) With Mobile Learning To Enhance Students' Reading Comprehension. *Jurnal Bahasa Dan Sastra Inggris*, 9.
- Mauizatul Hayati. (2024). Using Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (Circ) Method to Improve Students' Reading Comprehension. *Director*, 15(40), 6–13.
- Maulidia, F. R., & Prafitasari, A. N. (2023). Strategi Pembelajaran Berdiferensiasi Dalam Memenuhi Kebutuhan Belajar Peserta Didik. *ScienceEdu*, 6(1), 55.
- Melati Putri, M. L., & Astuti, S. (2023). Efektifitas Model Pembelajaran CIRC dalam Meningkatkan Keterampilan Membaca dan Hasil Belajar Bahasa Indonesia pada Siswa Kelas 3 Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Kewirausahaan*, 12(1), 178–193.
- Nani, N., Anitra, R., & Hendriana, E. C. (2022). Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran CIRC terhadap Keterampilan Membaca Pemahaman Siswa di Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa*, 11(2), 228–239.
- Nofrianni, E. (2023). Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (Circ) Terhadap Hasil Belajar Bahasa Indonesia Di Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Muara Pendidikan*, 8(2), 338–344.
- Nuril Lubaba, M., & Alfiansyah, I. (2022). Analisis Penerapan Profil Pelajar Pancasila Dalam Pembentukan Karakter Peserta Didik Di Sekolah Dasar. *EDUSAINTEK: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sains Dan Teknologi*, 9(3), 687–706.
- Nurohmah, A. N., Kartini, D., & Rustini, T. (2023). Relevansi Kebijakan Kurikulum Merdeka Dengan Pendidikan Abad 21 Pada Pembelajaran IPS di SD. *Jurnal Ilmiah Wahana Pendidikan*, Februari, 9(3), 25.
- Purwaningsih, P. (2023). Peningkatan Hasil Belajar Melalui Model Pembelajaran Penemuan Pada Peserta Didik Kelas Viii Smp Negeri 8 Cikarang Utara Kabupaten Bekasi. *EDUCATOR: Jurnal Inovasi Tenaga Pendidik Dan Kependidikan*, 2(4), 422–427.
- Rachmadhani, S. A. D., & Kamalia, P. U. (2023). Analisis Strategi Pembelajaran Berdiferensiasi terhadap Hasil Belajar Peserta Didik: Systematic Literature Review. *Asatiza: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 4(3), 178–192.
- Rahman, A., Munandar, S. A., Fitriani, A., Karlina, Y., & Yumriani. (2022). Pengertian Pendidikan, Ilmu Pendidikan dan Unsur-Unsur Pendidikan. *Al Urwatul Wutsqa: Kajian Pendidikan Islam*, 2(1), 1–8.
- Rahmi, Y., & Marnola, I. (2020). Peningkatan Kemampuan Membaca Pemahaman Siswa Melalui Model Pembelajaran Cooperative Integrated Reading and Compotion (Circ). *Jurnal*

- Basicedu*, 4(3), 662–672.
- Rahmi Yulia, D. (2023). Relevansi Filsafat Progresivisme Terhadap Pelaksanaan Kurikulum Merdeka Dalam Menyongsong Era Society 5.0. *Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Dasar*, 08(1), 1–7.
- Riana, R. (2022). Penggunaan Model Circ Dalam Meningkatkan Kemampuan Siswa Membaca Pemahaman Sastra Melayu Klasik. *Warta Dharmawangsa*, 16(3), 581–591.
- Sakkir, G., & Haturrahma, M. (2023). The Challenges in Teaching Writing through Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) Strategy. *ARRUS Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 3(3), 391–396.
- Saputra, A. (2022). Strategi Evaluasi Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam Pada SMP. *Genta Mulia: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan*, 13(2), 73–83.
- Saragih, E. G., Simanjuntak, E. B., Tamba, R., Tambunan, H. P., & Aulia, S. M. (2024). Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran CIRC terhadap Hasil Belajar Siswa pada Tema Berbagai Pekerjaan Kelas IV SD Swasta Methodist-6. *Jurnal Pendidikan ...*, 8, 8728–8739.
- Sari, N. L. M. (2023). Meningkatkan Kemampuan Membaca Teks Penyerta Gambar (Caption) Dengan Menerapkan Model Pembelajaran Cooperative Learning Tipe Circ (Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition) Pada Siswa Kelas Xii Mipa 1 Sman 1 Kubutambahan Tahun Pelajaran 2022-2023. *Daiwi Widya*, 10(1), 24–37.
- Setiawan, A., Nugroho, W., & Widyaningtyas, D. (2022). Pengaruh Minat Belajar Terhadap Hasil Belajar Siswa Kelas Vi Sdn 1 Gamping. *TANGGAP : Jurnal Riset Dan Inovasi Pendidikan Dasar*, 2(2), 92–109.
- Sewang1, A., & Aswad2, M. (2023). *Al-Ishlah: Jurnal Pendidikan Dampak Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) Terhadap Hasil Belajar Siswa*. 15(4), 6446–6456.
- Silva, H., Lopes, J., Dominguez, C., & Morais, E. (2022). Lecture, Cooperative Learning and Concept Mapping: Any Differences on Critical and Creative Thinking Development. *International Journal of Instruction*, 15(1), 765–780.
- Suryaman, M. (2020). Orientasi Pengembangan Kurikulum Merdeka Belajar. *Seminar Nasional Pendidikan Bahasa Dan Sastra*, 1(1), 13–28.
- Susiani. (2022). Jurnal Scientia is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (CC BY-NC 4.0) Application Of The Circ Learning Model To Improve Student Learning Results On Historical Text Material In Class Xii Mipa 1 Sma Negeri 1. *Jurnal Scientia*, 11(2).
- Syafitri, C. R., & Mansurdin. (2020). Model Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition sebagai Upaya Meningkatkan Kemampuan Membaca Pemahaman Siswa di Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Pendidikan Tambusai*, 4(2), 1335–1346.
- Syamsia, & Yuyun. (2023). Using Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) Method to Improve of Students' Reading Comprehension at The Second Grade Students of SMP Negeri 1 Wasile. In *International Journal of English and Literature* (Vol. 1, Issue 1).
- Tarigan, R. S. (2022). Improved Ability to Convert News Texts into Dialogue Forms with the Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) Learning Model for Class IX Students of Berastagi Methodist Middle School in the 2020/2021 Academic Year. *IJEMS: Indonesian Journal of Education and Mathematical Science*, 3(1), 26.

Wahono, B., Lin, P. L., & Chang, C. Y. (2020). Evidence of STEM enactment effectiveness in Asian student learning outcomes. *International Journal of STEM Education*, 7(1).

Wahyuni, F. N. (2022). Efektifitas Model Pembelajaran Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition (CIRC) Terhadap Kemampuan Membaca Pemahaman Siswa Pada Mata Pelajaran Bahasa Indonesia di Sekolah Dasar. *Seminar Nasional Paedagoria*, 3(20), 234–243.

Wei, X., Saab, N., & Admiraal, W. (2021). Assessment of cognitive, behavioral, and affective learning outcomes in massive open online courses: A systematic literature review. *Computers and Education*, 163.

Wongsuwan, N., & Regiana, A. A. (2023). Examining the Effect of Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) on Students' Reading Comprehension. *International Journal of Research in Education*, 3(1), 51–61.