

ELECTORAL GOVERNANCE OF CAMPAIGN MATERIALS: THE ROLE OF BAWASLU IN REGULATING CAMPAIGN MATERIALS (APK) DURING PILKADA 2024 IN BARITO UTARA

Muhammad Kurniawan^{*1}, Abdul Khair², M. Luthfi Setiarno Putera³

E-mail: kurniawan159@gmail.com

E-mail: abdul.khair@iain-palangkaraya.ac.id

E-mail: m.luthfi@iain-palangkaraya.ac.id

¹²³UIN Palangkaraya, Indonesia

*corresponding author

Abstract

This study analyzes the role of the Election Supervisory Agency (Bawaslu) of Barito Utara Regency in regulating campaign materials (APK) during the 2024 regional elections (Pilkada) in Muara Teweh City. The widespread use of APKs often leads to environmental and aesthetic concerns, particularly due to their placement in locations that violate existing regulations. Bawaslu Barito Utara holds the authority to monitor and enforce the proper installation of APKs in accordance with the regulations set by the General Elections Commission (KPU) and Bawaslu itself. However, this study identifies several challenges, including limited resources, inadequate coordination with relevant stakeholders, and the ineffective implementation of sanctions. The research employs an empirical legal method using a socio-legal approach, involving observation, interviews with key stakeholders, and analysis of legal documents. The findings indicate that although Bawaslu has carried out supervisory duties, its effectiveness remains hindered by structural and operational factors. The study recommends strengthening Bawaslu's institutional capacity, particularly in terms of resources, and improving regulations to enable more effective law enforcement in future elections. These findings are expected to contribute to the enhancement of democratic processes and electoral governance in Indonesia.

Keywords: Campaign Materials, Bawaslu, 2024 Regional Elections, Barito Utara.

INTRODUCTION

Since gaining independence in 1945, Indonesia has adopted a democratic system of governance that places the sovereignty of the people as its core principle. General elections (Pemilu) in Indonesia are held periodically to elect members of the House of

Representatives (DPR), Regional Representative Council (DPD), the President, Vice President, and members of the Regional People's Representative Council (DPRD).¹

Both general and regional elections (Pilkada) are conducted based on the principles of directness, universality, freedom, confidentiality, honesty, and fairness, as enshrined in the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia and Pancasila.² These foundational principles align with the implementation of a democratic system that seeks to uphold national unity and constitutional integrity, alongside consistent legal enforcement to ensure fairness in the electoral process.³

Pilkada, as a vital part of democratic practice, is held every five years to elect regional leaders such as governors, regents, and mayors. It is conducted through direct voting by the people, aiming to select leaders who will manage governance at the regional level. Muara Teweh, the capital of North Barito Regency, is characterized by a majority population of the Dayak Bakumpai ethnic group. This city faces particular challenges concerning the selection and management of campaign tools or election campaign props (APK) in the 2024 Pilkada.⁴

The use of APKs, such as billboards, banners, and flags to convey candidates' visions, has resulted in environmental issues, including waste accumulation and microplastic pollution due to non-eco-friendly materials. According to Bawaslu Regulation No. 12 of 2024, Article 14, monitoring environmentally friendly APKs is critically important.⁵ However, the implementation of this monitoring still encounters challenges, especially regarding mechanisms for post-campaign cleanup and the use of recycled materials.⁶

¹ Masyithah Umar Erla Sharfina Permata Noor, Ahmadi Hasan, "Demokrasi Di Indonesia Mewujudkan Kedaulatan Rakyat," *Indonesian Journal of Islamic Jurisprudence, Economic and Legal Theory* 1, no. 4 (2023): 679-693, <https://doi.org/https://shariajournal.com/index.php/IJJEL/article/download/196/70>.

² Ellya Rosana, "Negara Demokrasi dan Hak Asasi Manusia," *Jurnal Tapis: Jurnal Teropong Aspirasi Politik Islam* 12, no. 1 (January 5, 2016): 37-53, <https://doi.org/10.24042/TPS.V12I1.827>.

³ Wardatul Mutmainnah dan Siti Tiara Maulia, "Penerapan Sistem Demokrasi Untuk Menjaga Persatuan Dan Konstitusi Serta Penegakan Hukumnya," *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran* 4, no. 2 (2024): 111-17, <https://doi.org/https://digitalpress.gaes-edu.com/index.php/jpled/article/download/284/203>.

⁴ "Pilkada Serentak 2024, Dorong Penggunaan Alat Peraga Kampanye Ramah Lingkungan - BetangTV," accessed February 16, 2025, <https://betang.tv/2024/10/pilkada-serentak-2024-dorong-penggunaan-alat-peraga-kampanye-ramah-lingkungan/>.

⁵ "Peraturan Bawaslu No. 12 Tahun 2024," accessed February 17, 2025, <https://peraturan.bpk.go.id/Details/305418/peraturan-bawaslu-no-12-tahun-2024>.

⁶ Azka Abdi Amruobbi, "Problematisasi Sampah Visual Media Luar Ruang: Tinjauan Regulasi Kampanye Pemilu Dan Pilkada," *Jurnal Adhyasta Pemilu* 4, no. 2 (2021): 66-78.

Despite preventive efforts by the North Barito Bawaslu, instances of improper APK installation persist. During the cooling-off period before the 2024 Pilkada in Muara Teweh, several violations were found, such as billboards still installed in prohibited areas like electricity poles, and several APKs that had not been removed. This indicates that the implementation of regulations and supervision has not been fully effective. Although Bawaslu has taken various preventive measures, the enforcement of APK regulations during the cooling-off period remains suboptimal.⁷

In terms of effectiveness, interviews with residents of Muara Teweh indicate that APKs do not significantly influence their political decisions.⁸ Most respondents stated that their choices were more influenced by political party affiliations and candidate popularity rather than the presence of campaign materials. Only a small proportion of respondents felt that APKs affected their choices. These findings suggest that while APKs may influence a subset of voters, their overall impact is limited and inconsistent.

The North Barito Regency Bawaslu plays a crucial role in overseeing the installation of APKs during the 2024 Pilkada in Muara Teweh. Despite possessing regulatory authority, the effectiveness of supervision and enforcement of APK violations remains a challenge. A study by Rikho Adriadi (2025) in North Bengkulu shows that APK violations frequently occur despite the existence of administrative sanctions, indicating that the current monitoring mechanisms are not yet effective.⁹

Luther Gulick, in his theory of supervision, asserts that effective oversight includes not only the identification of violations but also the prevention of similar violations in the future. In the context of North Barito Bawaslu, this theory is highly relevant in understanding how Bawaslu can function effectively in regulating APK placement. Gulick emphasizes the importance of proactive and systematic oversight, supported by transparent and accountable communication with the public. Preventive and well-

⁷ Syabrina Yolanda Chansa Damanik and Khalid Khalid, "Pelanggaran Hukum Terhadap Pemasangan Alat Peraga Kampanye Sembarangan Dalam Pemilihan Umum Legislatif Di Kota Medan," *UNES Law Review* 6, no. 2 (2023): 7473-80.

⁸ "Hasil Wawancara Dengan Komisaris Panwascam Barito Utara Dan Staff Terkait Peletakan Alat Peraga Kampanye Di Kota Muara Teweh- Tanggal 5 Desember 2024," 2024.

⁹ Rekho Adriadi, "Peran Bawaslu Dalam Menertibkan Pelanggaran Alat Peraga Kampanye Studi Kasus Di Bengkulu Utara," *Jurnal Kalacakra: Ilmu Sosial Dan Pendidikan* 6, no. 1 (February 6, 2025): 87-97, <https://doi.org/10.31002/KALACAKRA.V6I1.9429>.

organized supervision can deter recurrent violations, thereby enhancing the integrity of the 2024 Pilkada.¹⁰

Post-election research is essential for evaluating weaknesses in APK supervision and usage during the 2024 Pilkada in Muara Teweh, serving as a foundation for improvements in future elections. This evaluation aims to enhance APK regulations and improve the quality of democracy and the integrity of regional elections. Hasyim Asy'ari, a commissioner of the General Elections Commission (KPU RI), underscores the importance of evaluating the electoral system to address deficiencies in Pilkada implementation. The core issue of this study pertains to Bawaslu's supervision, particularly concerning Bawaslu Regulation No. 12 of 2024, Article 14, and the impact of APKs on the public.

Research on the supervision of election campaign tools (Alat Peraga Kampanye or APK) during regional elections (Pilkada) has been widely conducted across various regions in Indonesia, revealing numerous issues related to the implementation and oversight of APKs. A study by Nashat Al Najjar (2018)¹¹ in the city of Parepare found that although Bawaslu had monitored the installation of APKs, its effectiveness remained low due to the frequent occurrence of violations, such as the placement of APKs in non-designated areas. Similarly, research by Choirul Anam (2018) identified comparable issues in regional elections, highlighting the ineffectiveness of the monitoring mechanisms implemented by the KPU and Bawaslu, particularly in regulating the quantity and design of APKs used by political parties and candidates.¹²

Based on these previous studies, there exists a significant gap in the implementation of APK supervision, especially during the electoral cooling-off period. This study reveals that although the North Barito Regency Bawaslu has made efforts to regulate non-compliant APKs, a number of violations still occurred, such as the placement of APKs in prohibited areas and their continued presence during the cooling-off period. The study

¹⁰ L. Gulick, "Notes on the Theory of Organization," *The Public Administration Review* 2, no. 2 (1937): 1-15.

¹¹ Nashat Al Najjar, "Efektivitas Peran Bawaslu Dalam Menangani Pelanggaran Alat Peraga Kampanye Pemilu Di Kota Parepare," July 25, 2024.

¹² Choirul Anam, "Pengaturan Alat Peraga Kampanye Dalam Pelaksanaan Pemilihan Kepala Daerah," *JKMP (Jurnal Kebijakan Dan Manajemen Publik)* 6, no. 2 (2018): 113-18, <https://doi.org/10.21070/jkmp.v6i2.3005>.

identifies that the supervision carried out by Bawaslu in North Barito has not been fully effective, due to several factors, including limited resources, lack of inter-agency coordination, and suboptimal legal enforcement. This research fills the existing gap by examining more deeply the impact of weaknesses in APK oversight on the overall effectiveness of the electoral process. It not only discusses the challenges faced by Bawaslu in enforcing the regulations but also proposes solutions to strengthen monitoring and improve inter-agency coordination, with the aim of ensuring more effective and regulation-compliant APK management.

METHOD

This research was conducted in Muara Teweh City, North Barito Regency, Central Kalimantan, driven by concerns over the improper installation of campaign tools (Alat Peraga Kampanye or APK) by the campaign teams of regional head and deputy head candidates, as well as the supervision carried out by the North Barito Regency Election Supervisory Body (Bawaslu). The study employs a socio-legal approach, which views law not merely as a set of normative rules, but also as a social practice that is accepted and understood within the community. This approach examines the gap between the ideal law (*das sollen*) and the actual reality in the field (*das sein*). Data collection techniques included observation, interviews, and documentation. The researcher conducted direct observations of APK installations during the cooling-off period of the 2024 regional elections and carried out interviews with Bawaslu officials and members of the community regarding the regulation of APKs. Photographic documentation of APKs installed in violation of regulations was also gathered as evidence of non-compliance. To ensure the validity of the data, triangulation techniques were employed by comparing the findings from interviews, observations, and documentation. The data analysis was conducted using a qualitative approach, whereby the collected data were thematically analyzed to identify patterns and gaps in the implementation of regulations, as well as to understand how legal norms are applied in practice.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

1. Duties and Authorities of the Election Supervisory Body (Bawaslu)

The conduct of general elections is closely tied to campaign activities, which must be carried out in accordance with the principles of honesty, fairness, legal certainty, and efficiency, as stipulated in Article 2 of PKPU (General Election Commission Regulation) No. 15 of 2023. These principles aim to ensure that campaigns are conducted fairly and transparently, providing equal opportunities for all electoral participants while minimizing abuse of power. This regulation also governs campaign content, implementation methods, and campaign prohibitions, such as the ban on installing campaign props (Alat Peraga Kampanye or APK) in places of worship, hospitals, and educational facilities to maintain public order and prevent misuse of public infrastructure.¹³

Charles U. Larson identifies three types of campaigns: product-oriented campaigns, which focus on the programs or solutions offered by candidates to meet voter needs; candidate-oriented campaigns, which emphasize the candidate's image, character, and competence to build voter trust; and ideological campaigns, which center on the values or ideologies upheld by the candidate or political party, such as environmental advocacy or specific socio-economic policies. These three types of campaigns can be used individually or in combination to achieve various political objectives.¹⁴

Campaign props (APK) are media tools used by candidates or political parties to convey political messages during the campaign period. APKs include billboards, banners, posters, pamphlets, and similar materials. Their primary function is to introduce candidates or political parties and to raise public awareness of the general or regional elections. According to PKPU No. 15 of 2023, the installation of APKs must comply with specific provisions related to size, location, and content, adhering to principles of transparency, openness, and public order. Although effective in candidate recognition,

¹³ "Tatacara Kampanye Pemilu Menurut Aturan Hukum | SIP Law Firm," accessed May 28, 2025, https://siplawfirm.id/kampanye-pemilu/?lang=id&utm_.

¹⁴ Charles U. Larson, *Perspectives on Political Campaigns*. (New York, 2020).

APKs often provide limited information and tend to influence voters cognitively without necessarily encouraging direct electoral participation.¹⁵

The North Barito Regency Election Supervisory Body (Bawaslu) is authorized to supervise APK installation in accordance with Bawaslu Regulation No. 12 of 2024. However, despite existing regulations, APK-related violations remain prevalent, indicating that oversight mechanisms are not yet optimal. The enforcement of APK regulations involves coordination among sub-district supervisory committees (Panwascam), village-level supervisors (PKD), and municipal police (Satpol PP). Panwascam is responsible for monitoring and reporting violations, PKD assists in data collection and monitoring of APKs, while Satpol PP is tasked with removing non-compliant APKs.

APK functions as a medium for electoral participants to disseminate their vision, mission, and campaign programs to the public, often in the form of billboards, banners, posters, and similar materials. Despite their crucial role in political campaigns, violations frequently occur, potentially harming urban aesthetics and leading to unfairness in the campaign process.¹⁶

Violations related to APK occur when campaign materials are installed in ways that contradict the rules established by the KPU and Bawaslu. Common infractions include placing APKs in prohibited areas such as places of worship, educational institutions, government facilities, and certain designated public spaces. Other violations include exceeding the permitted size of APKs or failing to remove them during the mandatory cooling-off period, during which campaign activities are prohibited. Such violations contravene the principles of a free and fair election, which require voters to make objective decisions without undue influence from lingering campaign materials. Thus, Bawaslu plays a vital role in enforcing APK regulations and imposing sanctions on violators to ensure a transparent and equitable electoral process.¹⁷

¹⁵ Muchamad Yuliyanto, "Evaluasi Alat Peraga Kampanye Pemilihan Umum Di Era Demokrasi Elektoral," *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial* 13, no. 1 (February 26, 2014): 33–41, <https://doi.org/10.14710/JIS.13.1.2014.33-41>.

¹⁶ Dedy Syahputra and Muhammad Rajief, "Tugas dan Wewenang Bawaslu Di Indonesia Pasca Undang-Undang Nomor 7 Tahun 2017 Tentang Penyelenggaraan Pemilu," *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Konseling* 4, no. 4 (2022): 1289–97.

¹⁷ Rizky Darmawansyah Sihombing, "Problematisa Masa Pemilihan Umum Perspektif Teori Utilitarianisme Jeremy Banthem," *Grondwe* 3, no. 1 (2024): 300–314.

As the electoral supervisory agency, Bawaslu holds the authority to regulate and oversee APK installations in accordance with applicable laws, particularly Bawaslu Regulation No. 12 of 2024 on Campaign Prop Supervision. In general, Bawaslu's responsibilities include monitoring all stages of the election process, including campaigns, receiving reports of violations, and resolving electoral disputes. Bawaslu is also tasked with ensuring that APK installations comply with relevant provisions, including regulations on location, size, materials, and timing.

Legal enforcement of APK violations is essential for safeguarding the integrity of elections in Indonesia. Despite the existence of rules governing APK installation, field practices show that violations frequently occur – such as the installation of APKs in trees, places of worship, and other public facilities. This reflects the need for stronger oversight and more effective law enforcement to ensure consistent compliance with regulations.¹⁸ The North Barito Regency Bawaslu has the authority to monitor APK installations and impose administrative sanctions, such as warnings or orders to remove non-compliant materials. However, in practice, enforcement efforts often face constraints due to limited authority and resources.¹⁹

2. Challenges and Obstacles Faced by the Barito Utara Election Supervisory Body

The Barito Utara Regency Election Supervisory Body (Bawaslu) holds the authority to supervise and regulate the installation of campaign props (APK) that violate existing regulations, including those concerning placement timeframes and locations. During the 2024 Regional Head Election (Pilkada), a total of 735 APKs were recorded in the urban areas of Muara Teweh City. However, 25 of these APKs remained installed during the designated campaign silence period (24–26 November 2024), comprising 17 violations from candidate pair 1 and 8 violations from candidate pair 2.

¹⁸ Jafar Abdul. Azis, "Peran Bawaslu Dalam Penegakan Hukum Dan Pemberian Sanksi Terhadap Alat Peraga Kampanye Pada Pilkada Serentak Wilayah Hukum Administrasi Kabupaten Indragiri Hilir," *Indragiri Law Review* 2, no. 2 (2024): 24–32.

¹⁹ dan Khalid Khalid Damanik, Syabrina Yolanda Chansa, "Pelanggaran Hukum Terhadap Pemasangan Alat Peraga Kampanye Sembarangan Dalam Pemilihan Umum Legislatif Di Kota Medan," *NES Law Review* 6, no. 2 (2023): 7473–80.



Picture 1. Percentage of APKs and offences in the urban sector

In an interview with the Subdistrict Election Supervisory Committee of Teweh Tengah (Panwascam Teweh Tengah),²⁰ it was revealed that despite efforts by the Barito Utara Regency Election Supervisory Agency (Bawaslu) to regulate the installation of campaign materials (APK), significant violations persist—particularly the display of APKs during the campaign silence period and in prohibited locations. This indicates a gap between existing regulations and their implementation on the ground. According to Luther Gulick's theory of supervision, effective oversight should not only focus on identifying violations but also on preventing similar breaches in the future. Gulick emphasizes the importance of proactive and systematic monitoring, along with transparent and accountable communication to the public.²¹

Furthermore, the interview findings suggest that the influence of APKs on voters' political decisions is relatively limited. This implies that, although APKs serve a cognitive function in introducing candidates, enforcement against their misuse has not been sufficient to uphold the integrity of the electoral process. According to Gulick, effective supervision must include firm and consistent legal enforcement to mitigate violations and ensure a fair and transparent electoral system.

Another major challenge is the suboptimal coordination among relevant institutions. The process of APK regulation, which involves Bawaslu, law enforcement agencies, and local governments, is often hampered by bureaucratic red tape and a lack of mutual

²⁰ Rizky Amelia, *Wawancara Panwascam Teweh Tengah 30 November, 2024*.

²¹ Dwi Handayani, "Kendala Bawaslu Dalam Penertiban Alat Peraga Kampanye Pada Masa Tenang Pemilu," *Jurnal Administrasi Negara* 8, no. 2 (2021): 145–47.

understanding among stakeholders. Moreover, law enforcement related to APK violations tends to be weak, primarily due to the low level of compliance with existing regulations.²²

Bawaslu Barito Utara also encounters difficulties in raising public awareness about the importance of maintaining neutrality during the campaign silence period. Many citizens perceive the installation of campaign materials as part of their freedom of expression, without understanding its negative impact on the objectivity of elections. Field findings indicate that most members of the public do not feel affected by the presence of APKs, even when they are installed in violation of regulations – highlighting the low effectiveness of the supervisory efforts currently in place. In line with Gulick's theory, effective oversight should prioritize preventive strategies rather than merely reactive responses.

In addition, the lack of public understanding is often exacerbated by inadequate outreach and education from Bawaslu and related institutions regarding the fundamental purpose of the campaign silence period, which is intended to be free from any form of electoral influence. Therefore, strengthening communication and educational initiatives targeting the public is crucial to foster a deeper understanding of the importance of neutrality in the democratic process. The absence of effective public outreach on the meaning and consequences of campaign violations during the silence period has led to low public participation in supporting enforcement efforts. Without sufficient public awareness, Bawaslu's regulatory actions lose their impact, thereby reducing the overall effectiveness of electoral oversight.²³

CONCLUSION

This study reveals that the Election Supervisory Agency of Barito Utara Regency (Bawaslu) plays a crucial role in monitoring campaign materials (APK) during the 2024 regional elections (Pilkada) in Muara Teweh City. Although Bawaslu has made efforts to

²² Tri Yuliana, "Penyebab Ketidakberhasilan Penertiban Alat Peraga Kampanye Oleh Bawaslu Di Masa Tenang," *Jurnal Hukum Dan Pemerintahan* 6, no. 1 (2020): 75–77.

²³ Anisa Sari, "Pengaruh Koordinasi Antar Lembaga Terhadap Efektivitas Penertiban Alat Peraga Kampanye Pemilu," *Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan* 7, no. 3 (2019): 99–101.

regulate APKs that violate the rules, several obstacles – such as limited resources, budget constraints, and weak inter-agency coordination – continue to hinder the effectiveness of its oversight. Violations involving the placement of APKs in prohibited areas and during the campaign silence period indicate the need for improved supervision and stronger law enforcement. Moreover, the low level of public awareness regarding the importance of maintaining neutrality during the silence period further undermines the effectiveness of regulatory efforts. To enhance short-term supervision, Bawaslu must strengthen the capacity of its personnel through training, improve coordination with relevant institutions, and actively educate the public about electoral neutrality and the adverse effects of unauthorized campaign materials.

In terms of recommendations, long-term improvements should include regulatory reforms concerning APKs that consider technological advancements and emerging issues – such as environmentally friendly APK materials and standardized procedures for enforcement. Enhancing supervisory infrastructure by leveraging technology, such as applications or real-time monitoring systems, would facilitate more efficient identification and removal of illegal campaign materials. Bawaslu also requires adequate budgetary support to ensure comprehensive oversight across all areas, including the procurement of equipment and personnel. Furthermore, ongoing public education programs to raise awareness about fair elections and the importance of neutrality will help instill a deeper understanding of electoral regulations from an early stage.

REFERENCES

Article

- Adriadi, Rekho. "Peran Bawaslu Dalam Menertibkan Pelanggaran Alat Peraga Kampanye Studi Kasus Di Bengkulu Utara." *Jurnal Kalacakra: Ilmu Sosial Dan Pendidikan* 6, no. 1 (February 6, 2025): 87-97. <https://doi.org/10.31002/KALACAKRA.V6I1.9429>.
- Anam, Choirul. "Pengaturan Alat Peraga Kampanye Dalam Pelaksanaan Pemilihan Kepala Daerah." *JKMP (Jurnal Kebijakan Dan Manajemen Publik)* 6, no. 2 (2018): 113-18. <https://doi.org/10.21070/jkmp.v6i2.3005>.
- Azis, Jafar Abdul. "Peran Bawaslu Dalam Penegakan Hukum Dan Pemberian Sanksi Terhadap Alat Peraga Kampanye Pada Pilkada Serentak Wilayah Hukum

- Administrasi Kabupaten Indragiri Hilir." *Indragiri Law Review* 2, no. 2 (2024): 24–32.
- Azka Abdi Amrurobbi. "Problematika Sampah Visual Media Luar Ruang: Tinjauan Regulasi Kampanye Pemilu Dan Pilkada." *Jurnal Adhyasta Pemilu* 4, no. 2 (2021): 66–78.
- Damanik, Syabrina Yolanda Chansa, and Khalid Khalid. "Pelanggaran Hukum Terhadap Pemasangan Alat Peraga Kampanye Sembarangan Dalam Pemilihan Umum Legislatif Di Kota Medan." *UNES Law Review* 6, no. 2 (2023): 7473–80.
- Erla Sharfina Permata Noor, Ahmadi Hasan, dan Masyithah Umar. "Demokrasi Di Indonesia Mewujudkan Kedaulatan Rakyat." *Indonesian Journal of Islamic Jurisprudence, Economic and Legal Theory* 1, no. 4 (2023): 679–693. <https://doi.org/https://shariajournal.com/index.php/IJIJEL/article/download/196/70>.
- Gulick, L. "Notes on the Theory of Organization." *The Public Administration Review* 2, no. 2 (1937): 1–15.
- Handayani, Dwi. "Kendala Bawaslu Dalam Penertiban Alat Peraga Kampanye Pada Masa Tenang Pemilu." *Jurnal Administrasi Negara* 8, no. 2 (2021): 145–47.
- Maulia, Wardatul Mutmainnah dan Siti Tiara. "Penerapan Sistem Demokrasi Untuk Menjaga Persatuan Dan Konstitusi Serta Penegakan Hukumnya." *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran* 4, no. 2 (2024): 111–17. <https://doi.org/https://digitalpress.gaes-edu.com/index.php/jpled/article/download/284/203>.
- Najjar, Nashat Al. "Efektivitas Peran Bawaslu Dalam Menangani Pelanggaran Alat Peraga Kampanye Pemilu Di Kota Parepare," July 25, 2024.
- Rosana, Ellya. "NEGARA DEMOKRASI DAN HAK ASASI MANUSIA." *Jurnal Tapis: Jurnal Teropong Aspirasi Politik Islam* 12, no. 1 (January 5, 2016): 37–53. <https://doi.org/10.24042/TPS.V12I1.827>.
- Sari, Anisa. "Pengaruh Koordinasi Antar Lembaga Terhadap Efektivitas Penertiban Alat Peraga Kampanye Pemilu." *Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan* 7, no. 3 (2019): 99–101.
- Sihombing, Rizky Darmawansyah. "Problematika Masa Pemilihan Umum Perspektif Teori Utilitarianisme Jeremy Banthem." *Grondwe* 3, no. 1 (2024): 300–314.
- Syahputra, Dedy, and Muhammad Rajief. "Tugas Dan Wewenang Bawaslu Di Indonesia Pasca Undang-Undang Nomor 7 Tahun 2017 Tentang Penyelenggaraan Pemilu." *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Konseling* 4, no. 4 (2022): 1289–97.
- Wheeler, S. "Socio-Legal Studies in 2020." *Journal of Law and Society* 47, no. 2 (2024): 1–15.
- Yuliana, Tri. "Penyebab Ketidakterhasilan Penertiban Alat Peraga Kampanye Oleh Bawaslu Di Masa Tenang." *Jurnal Hukum Dan Pemerintahan* 6, no. 1 (2020): 75–77.

Yuliyanto, Muchamad. "EVALUASI ALAT PERAGA KAMPANYE PEMILIHAN UMUM DI ERA DEMOKRASI ELEKTORAL." *JURNAL ILMU SOSIAL* 13, no. 1 (February 26, 2014): 33–41. <https://doi.org/10.14710/JIS.13.1.2014.33-41>.

Book

Larson, Charles U. *Perspectives on Political Campaigns*. New york, 2020.

Internet/ Website

"Pilkada Serentak 2024, Dorong Penggunaan Alat Peraga Kampanye Ramah Lingkungan – BetangTV." Accessed February 16, 2025. <https://betang.tv/2024/10/pilkada-serentak-2024-dorong-penggunaan-alat-peraga-kampanye-ramah-lingkungan/>.

"Tatacara Kampanye Pemilu Menurut Aturan Hukum | SIP Law Firm." Accessed May 28, 2025. https://siplawfirm.id/kampanye-pemilu/?lang=id&utm_.

Interview

Amelia, Rizky. *Wawancara Panwascam Teweh Tengah 30 November, 2024*.

"Hasil Wawancara Dengan Komisaris Panwascam Barito Utara Dan Staff Terkait Peletakan Alat Peraga Kampanye Di Kota Muara Teweh- Tanggal 5 Desember 2024," 2024.